

Crow And Tal-Fruit Logic

BY: MAHESH RAJA

Jan 29, USA (SUN) — In reply to Purujit dasa.

"Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura dedicated a part of his masterpiece novel, *Jaiva Dharma*, to our topic in question. (Excerpts are [available here](#) for your perusal.) Were *they* wasting their time with useless discussion of "crows and tal-fruit logic"? Obviously not.

We do not have a problem with Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura but we DO have problem with MIS-INTERPRETATIONS from Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura's books. In fact, Srila Prabhupada admonished against taking any outside instructions.

Letter 73-12-25: Gurukrpa, Yasodanandana:

"Whatever is to be learned of the teachings of Srila Bhaktivinoda Thakura can be learned from our books. There is no need whatsoever for any outside instruction."

Purujit finds the Quotations of Srila Prabhupada in my article "[Crow And Tal-Fruit Logic](#)", "as heavily tainted with mayavada philosophy", THEN he has the audacity to correct Srila Prabhupada.

Lets analyze:

Quote # 2 (lose excerpts): Just like one man is dreaming and he forgets himself. In dream, he creates himself in different forms: now I am the King discussing like that. This creation of himself is as seer and subject matter or seen, two things. But as soon as the dream is over, the "seen" disappears. But the seer remains. Now he is in his original position.... We dream this body and so many relationships with other things.... So this dreaming condition is called non-liberated life, and this is just like a dream.

Purujit dasa writes:

"These explanations are heavily tainted with mayavada philosophy. Material world is not a dream. We dream neither our body nor surrounding material objects. Material energy is as real as spiritual energy but our perception of it is perverted by our desire to dominate and so we perceive it as the object of our enjoyment. Transformations of the material energy are temporary but the energy itself is eternal. Process of perception (seeing, hearing, etc.) or object of our perception do not disappear once we are liberated. Quality of our perception changes but we, the perceptor, the object of our perception and the perception itself remain. Perception, object of perception and perceptor exist eternally connected and separate simultaneously (acintya-bheda-abheda-tattva) and never disappear or become one. Liberated soul perceives material objects exactly the way we presently perceive them but, the quality of his perception is different. For more detailed explanations please refer to Sad-Sandarbha of Srila Jiva Goswami Prabhupada."

Purujit states "These explanations are heavily tainted with mayavada philosophy. Material world is not a dream." Where in the passage does Srila Prabhupada say that Material world IS a dream? Purujit is using a strawman argument here. Unable to defeat the actual example, he concocts an argument that he can defeat. Is Srila Prabhupada identifying that Material world IS a dream? No! All Srila Prabhupada does give is an example for us to understand based upon dreaming state: "So this dreaming condition is called non-liberated life, and this is just like a dream". Where does "just like a dream"

indicate material world IS a dream? This is Purujit's fallacy. He is unable/unwilling to grasp the subject. So, according to Purujit, Srila Prabhupada's explanations "are heavily tainted with mayavada philosophy."

Hear are two statements from Bhaktivedanta Vedabase to back-up that the letter "Crow And Tal-Fruit Logic" **was in fact from Srila Prabhupada.**

"2.3.1 "Formerly we were with Krsna in His lila": In 1972, a devotee in Australia began saying that the living entities in this material world were originally situated in the brahmajyoti. According to Madhudvisa Prabhu and Caru Prabhu, who were both in Australia at the time, this caused some fairly widespread disturbance. Srila Prabhupada therefore dictated a response, a typed copy of which was retained by Madhudvisa Prabhu. This is the famous crow and tal fruit message. Madhudvisa has said that it was distributed to the Australian temple presidents. In this statement, given in direct response to inquiries from his students on the question of the origin of the jiva, Srila Prabhupada gives many definitive answers to the questions facing us. He intended these not just as answers to a particular devotee but as his official answer to a philosophical controversy that had arisen in the Society"

"80) THAT the GBC suggests that devotees interested in apparent logical contradictions surrounding the "fall of the jiva" read the following paper on the topic, which Srila Prabhupada had sent to devotees in Australia in 1972 to resolve controversies that arose among them about this topic. The paper came as an attachment to a letter from Srila Prabhupada to Madhudvisa dasa dated June 6, 1972."

Note: here is that attachment letter.

Crow And Tal-Fruit Logic

"We never had any occasion when we were separated from Krsna. Just like one man is dreaming and he forgets himself. In dream he creates himself in different forms: now I am the King discussing like that. This creation of himself is as seer and subject matter or seen, two things. But as soon as the dream is over, the "seen" disappears. But the seer remains. Now he is in his original position.

Our separation from Krsna is like that. We dream this body and so many relationships with other things. First the attachment comes to enjoy sense gratification. Even with Krsna desire for sense gratification is there. There is a dormant attitude for forgetting Krsna and creating an atmosphere for enjoying independently. Just like at the edge of the beach, sometimes the water covers, sometimes there is dry sand, coming and going. Our position is like that, sometimes covered, sometimes free, just like at the edge of the tide. As soon as we forget, immediately the illusion is there. Just like as soon as we sleep, dream is there.

We cannot say therefore that we are not with Krsna. As soon as we try to become Lord, immediately we are covered by Maya. Formerly we were with Krsna in His lila or sport. But this covering of Maya may be of very, very, very, very long duration, therefore many creations are coming and going. Due to this long period of time it is sometimes said that we are ever-conditioned. But his long duration of time becomes very insignificant when one actually comes to Krsna consciousness. Just like in a dream we are thinking very long time, but as soon as we awaken we look at our watch and see it has been a moment only. Just like with Krsna's friends, they were kept asleep for one year by Brahma, but when they woke up and Krsna returned before them, they considered that only a moment had passed.

So this dreaming condition is called non-liberated life, and this is just like a dream. Although in this material calculation it is a long, long period, as soon as we come to Krsna consciousness then this period is considered as a second. For example, Jaya and Vijaya. They had their lila with Krsna, but they had to come down for their little mistake. They were given mukti, emerging into the Brahmasayujya after being killed three times as demons. This Brahmasayujya mukti is non-permanent. Every living entity wants pleasure, but Brahmasayujya is minus pleasure. There is eternal existence only. So when they do not find transcendental bliss, they fall down to make a compromise with material bliss. Just like Vivekananda founded so many schools and hospitals. So even Lord Brahma, he is still material and wants to lord it over. He may come down to become a germ, but then he may rise up to Krsna consciousness and go back to home, back to Godhead. This is the position.

So when I say Yes, there is eternal lila with Krsna, that means on the evidence of Jaya-Vijaya. Unless one develops full devotional service to Krsna, he goes up only up to Brahmasayujya but falls down. But after millions and millions of years of keeping oneself away from the lila of the Lord, when one comes to Krsna consciousness this period becomes insignificant, just like dreaming.

Because he falls down from Brahmasayujya, he thinks that may be his origin, but he does not remember that before that even he was with Krsna. So the conclusion is that whatever may be our past, let us come to Krsna consciousness and immediately join Krsna. Just like with a diseased man, it is a waste of time to try to find out how he has become diseased, better to spend time curing the disease.

On the top of the tree there is a nice tal-fruit. A crow went there and the fruit fell down. Some panditas, big big learned scholars saw this and discussed: the fruit fell due to the crow agitating the limb. No, the fruit fell simultaneously with the crow landing and frightened the crow so he flew away. No, the fruit was ripe and the weight of the crow landing broke it from the branch, and so on and so on. What is the use of such discussions? So whether you were in the Brahmasayujya or with Krsna in His lila, at the moment you are in neither, so the best policy is to develop your Krsna consciousness and go there, never mind what is your origin.

Brahmasayujya and Krsna lila--both may be possible, but when you are coming down from Brahmasayujya or when you are coming down from Krsna lila, that remains a mystery. But at the present moment we are in Maya's clutches, so at present our only hope is to become Krsna conscious and go back to Home, back to Godhead. The real position is servant of Krsna, and servant of Krsna means in Krsna lila. Directly or indirectly, always we are serving Krsna's lila. Even in dream. Just like we cannot go out of the sun when it is daytime, so where is the chance of going out of Krsna lila? The cloud may be there, it may become very gray and dim, but still the sunlight is there, everywhere, during the daytime. Because I am part and parcel of Krsna, I am always connected. My finger, even though it may be diseased, remains part and parcel of my body. Therefore, we try to treat it, cure it, because it is part and parcel. So Krsna comes Himself when we forget Him, or He sends His representative.

Awakening or dreaming, I am the same man. As soon as I awaken and see myself, I see Krsna. Cause and effect are both Krsna. Just like cotton becomes thread and thread becomes cloth, still, the original cause is cotton. Therefore, everything is Krsna in the ultimate sense. When we cannot contact Krsna personally, we contact His energies. So there is no chance to be outside Krsna's lila. But differences we see under different conditions. Just like in the pool of water and in the mirror the same me is reflecting, but in different reflections. One is shimmering, unsteady, one is clear and fixed. Except for being in Krsna consciousness, we cannot see our actual position rightly, therefore the learned man sees all living entities as the same parts and parcels of Krsna. Material existence is impersonal because my real personality is covered. But we should think that because I am now covered by this clay, I am

diseased, and we should think that I must get to business to get myself uncovered, not wonder how I got this way. Now the fruit is there, take it and enjoy, that is your first business. God is not bound by cause. He can change, He is the Cause of all Causes. Now don't waste your time with this "Kaka taliya nyaya," crows and tal-fruit logic."

Further evidence:

68-12-02 Letter to Rayarama:

The answer to your question about the marginal energy is that the jiva soul is always called marginal energy whether he is in the spiritual world or in the material world. There are instances where marginal energy jiva souls have fallen from the spiritual world, just like Jaya and Vijaya. So the potency to fall under the influence of the lower energy is always there. And thus the individual jiva soul is called as Krishna's marginal energy.

69-10-27 Letter to Upendra:

"Regarding your question, in one sense both you and Mahapurusa are right. The fact is that after the dissolution of the Universe the living entities remain in slumber within Maha Visnu, and again when the creation takes place they are impregnated in their original position and they come out in different species of life. By gradual evolutionary process, when they come to the human form there is good chance of getting out of the repeated birth and death, and one can enter into the Spiritual Realm. But if one loses this chance he is again put into the cycle of birth and death. The conditioned souls are always within the Maha Visnu Form, whereas the liberated souls in Vaikuntha, they are engaged in the service of the Lord. Constitutionally every living entity, even if he is in the Vaikuntha Loka, has chance of falling down. Therefore the living entity is called marginal energy. But when the falldown has taken place for the conditioned soul is very difficult to ascertain. Therefore two classes are designated: eternally liberated and eternally conditioned. But for arguments sake, a living entity being marginal energy, he can't be eternally conditioned. The Time is so unlimited that the conditioned souls appear to be eternally so, but from the philosophical view he cannot be eternally conditioned. Since we cannot trace out when we have become conditioned, there is no use of arguing on this point. Better to take care first how we can get rid of this conditional existence; as much as a patient should take care for treating his disease more, and less waste his time in finding out the cause of his disease."

71-10-09 Letter to Upendra:

"So far your question, the soul is fundamentally pure but he has an aptitude to come to the impure state of material contamination. He is therefore called tatastha or marginal. He has got the liberty of staying within the pure state or becoming contaminated. That is his choice. This marginal point can be understood in this way; just like you are standing on the shore of the sea. So you can remain on the land or sometimes you can jump into the water to enjoy as you will see on the beaches. So many young boys are enjoying. But that is dangerous at the same time. One who does not know swimming expertly well he may become drowned. Similarly the soul from the spiritual platform sometimes jumps over the material ocean of nescience. The Vedic knowledge gives him specific instruction how to swim over but if he is a rascal, he does not take the instruction through the bonafide representative, the spiritual master, and he becomes drowned. That is the position. The Vedic instruction is so nice that the soul, when he jumps over this material ocean, the Vedic instruction teaches him how to swim and come back again to the shore. This swimming process, according to Vedic instruction, is called sacrifice, charity and penance. One who

learns these techniques of swimming over the ocean of nescience, he goes back to home, back to Godhead. One who does not take to this swimming process, he becomes drowned. In the Bhagavad-gita this is stated *iccha dyesa samutthena . . . svarge yanti parantapa* which means deluded by desire to enjoy the material world and becoming envious of Krishna, one comes to this material world. (Bhagavad-gita, 7.27). So read our literature profusely and you will get sufficient knowledge."

In conclusion, Purujit is unable/unwilling to understand (due to contamination of mis-interpretations from Gaudiya Math books). Anyone with A sincere heart who studies these quotations/letters from Srila Prabhupada as above - which are in corroboration to [my article](#), will fully accept Srila Prabhupada's stating: "Because he falls down from Brahmasayujya, he thinks that may be his origin, but he does not remember that before that even he was with Krsna."